

Humboldt State University  
PSCI 640/PHIL 680; CRN 44352/44399  
Tuesdays, 2:00-4:50 p.m.  
Natural Resources Bldg. 222  
Fall Semester 2003

Susan Armstrong  
114B University Annex  
Hours: MW 10-11; TH 10-11  
*and by appointment*  
Phone: 826-5754  
sja3@humboldt.edu

John Meyer  
138 Founders Hall  
Hours: MW 11-12; W 3-4  
*and by appointment*  
Phone: 826-4497  
jmm7001@humboldt.edu

### **Rights, Politics, and the Environment**

This seminar focuses on the *values* that underlie social and political decisions regarding environmental concerns. We will evaluate and debate the significance of currently dominant ideas of liberalism and democracy in relation to these concerns. To do this, we will discuss the history of rights and relevant tensions within moral and political theory. We will explore the extent to which "nature" is a social construction and consider critical perspectives raised by feminists, socialists, conservatives, and communitarians, among others. Along the way, we will analyze the relationship of environmental concern to globalization, third world development, and land use in the U.S., as well as on the role of influential policy tools such as cost-benefit analysis. Assigned readings will be primarily by environmental philosophers, ethicists, and political theorists.

Since this course is a seminar, the quality and quantity of learning will depend crucially upon your careful reading and reflection in advance of our meeting and your thoughtful participation in all of our discussions.

#### ***Books and Course Packet:***

The following three *required* books are available at the HSU Bookstore.

John S. Dryzek and David Schlosberg, *Debating the Earth: The Environmental Politics Reader* (Oxford University Press, 1998) (Listed as **DTE**)

Avner de-Shalit, *The Environment: Between Theory and Practice* (Oxford, 2000).  
(Listed as '**de-Shalit**')

Terry L. Anderson and Donald R. Leal, *Free Market Environmentalism*. Revised Edition.  
(Palgrave, 2001). (Listed as **FME**)

The following book is *recommended* and will be available at the HSU Bookstore. It provides useful analysis and background on various strands of environmental thought:

John S. Dryzek, *The Politics of the Earth: Environmental Discourses* (Oxford University Press, 1997). (Listed as '**Dryzek**')

There is also a sizeable collection of readings that will be available online through ONCORES (see below). A few of the readings will be available only in the Department of Government and Politics colloquium room (FH 143). These readings are followed by: (FH 143).

You should carefully read all “required” readings prior to each week’s seminar. Those with an asterisk (\*) in front of them will be the primary focus of class discussion. “Additional Readings” are included for those that wish to do further research on a topic. These will often be available at the HSU Library. In almost every case, however, the books and articles listed as "additional" will also be available from either John or Susan.

**WRITING MATTERS:** Clear, well-formed writing is essential. If you haven’t already, we suggest that you purchase a manual of style. The best known, cheapest and most enjoyable to read is Strunk and White, now in a 4<sup>th</sup> edition. It can be purchased for under \$10.00

Citations. You can use any one of a number of formats in citing your references, *as long as you are consistent*. Some of the better known for use in the humanities and social sciences are:

- MLA Style (Modern Language Association)
- APA Style (American Psychological Association)
- Harvard System of Referencing
- Kate L. Turabian, *A Manual for Writers*

Any of the above styles can be accessed or in the reference section of the library and many are online (though you should own one!).

**ONCORES:** The HSU Library online course reserve system (ONCORES) is easy to access. Simply go to the **HSU homepage**, select '**Library**,' then select '**RESERVES/ONCORES**' on the left-hand side of the screen. You can then find the readings for our class by selecting either the instructor or course name from the drop down lists. The password this semester is: **ORCHID**. You will need (free) adobe reader software to open the files. We strongly recommend that you download and print online readings so that you can highlight relevant passages, write notes on them, and have them available in class.

### ***Course Requirements***

- 1) The primary written requirement of this seminar will consist of one or two papers. If you choose to write two papers, each must be 10-12 pages (double-spaced, normal margins and fonts), and the first will be due on Tuesday, October 14. If you choose the single paper option, this must be a research paper of 20-25 pages on a subject that you will choose in consultation with us.

Either this single paper, or the second of two shorter papers will be due on Monday, December 15. For students who write one paper, this will be worth 60% of your overall grade. If you write two papers, each will be worth 30% of your overall grade. **All papers must be submitted in a hard copy.**

- 2) Individuals as well as the class as a whole will benefit from the requirement that each student provide a 10-15 minute description of the papers above. If the student has chosen to write a single paper, the presentation will be a description of the proposed paper and its current progress. If the student has chosen to write two papers, the presentation will be a description of the first paper, which will have been submitted October 14. These presentations will occur during class either October 14 or 21.
  
- 3) You are also expected to turn in **eight** reading reaction papers. These papers should be **no longer than 500 words (~2 pages, double spaced)**. They should *first* concisely summarize and *then* react to one or more specific points that you found interesting or provocative in the current week's reading. You should *not* attempt a comprehensive summary of the week's readings. We will read these and record them on a '+', '√', or '-' basis. Reaction papers must be turned in by the beginning of our class session to be credited. These papers will be worth 20% of your overall grade.

Thoughtful and active participation in seminar discussions is expected. Of course, regular attendance is required for this. One week during the semester, you will also serve as an informal debater. Overall participation will be worth 20% of your overall grade.

**Guidelines for Informal Debates:** Each student will participate in presenting ideas in an informal debate format during one of the class sessions indicated. Two to four students will participate in each session. In order to prepare, please read the article(s) you will be using for debate and identify:

- A. basic assumptions made by the author
- B. basic structure of the argument
- C. quality of the evidence presented
- D. strengths of the argument
- E. weaknesses of the argument.

*The structure we will use (using Sept. 9 as an example):*

Pro-Leonard and Zeckhauser

Introduction 10 minutes

Rebuttal 10 minutes

Pro-Kelman

Introduction 10 minutes

Rebuttal 10 minutes

Break 5 minutes

Vote by class on persuasiveness of presentations

Discussion by class members

(Introduction: explain the main points in author's argument and its strengths)

(Rebuttal: respond to the points made in the Introduction by the other side.)

**Plagiarism:** Presenting the words or ideas of another as though they are your own is plagiarism. It is the most serious academic offense and intolerable at the graduate level. Copying distinctive phrases, sentences, paragraphs, whole pages, or more from the work of another (whether a classmate, newspaper, book, or website) without proper citation will result in the harshest penalties. Changing a few insignificant words, while still copying the rest, is actually *worse* (even if you cite it!). **JUST DON'T DO IT.** If you are at all unsure about this matter, please feel free to talk to one of us in advance of turning in your work.

**Incompletes:** No incompletes except in cases of emergency.

### ***Outline and Reading Schedule***

**PLEASE NOTE THAT THERE MAY BE CHANGES OR ADDITIONS TO THIS READING SCHEDULE.**

- I. August 26<sup>th</sup> Introduction**
- course and syllabus overview
  - "Survival" vs. "Prometheanism"
  - ethics and politics

Required Reading (assigned in advance):

\*DTE, Section I, pp. 7-40

\*Chapter 1 from Bjorn Lomborg, *The Skeptical Environmentalist*:  
[www.lomborg.com/skeptenvironChap1.pdf](http://www.lomborg.com/skeptenvironChap1.pdf)

\*Sample the critical responses published in *Scientific American* at  
[www.sciam.com/article.cfm?articleID=00000B96-9517-1CDA-B4A8809EC588EEDE](http://www.sciam.com/article.cfm?articleID=00000B96-9517-1CDA-B4A8809EC588EEDE)

\*de-Shalit, Chapter 2

Additional Readings:

Dryzek, Parts I and II (pp. 1-60)

### **II. Liberalism as Public Philosophy**

**September 2<sup>nd</sup>:** Liberal Roots of Rights-based Arguments

Required Readings<sup>1</sup>:

\* John Locke, *Two Treatises of Government*, Book II (*Second Treatise*)  
Chapters 2,5,7,8,9,19 (see footnote below)

\* John Stuart Mill, *On Liberty*, Chapter 4 (see footnote below)

\* John Rawls, from *A Theory of Justice* (ONCORES)

\* Ronald Dworkin, "Taking Rights Seriously" (ONCORES)

\* Michael Sandel, from *Democracy's Discontent* (ONCORES)

U.N. Universal Declaration of Human Rights: [www.unhchr.ch/udhr/lang/eng.pdf](http://www.unhchr.ch/udhr/lang/eng.pdf)

Additional Readings:

Ball and Dagger, "Liberalism". (ONCORES) ***This is a good textbook introduction on the political philosophy of liberalism for those that need one.***

J.S. Mill, *On Liberty*, ch. 5; *Utilitarianism*, chs. 2 and 5

Immanuel Kant, *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals* (1785)

John Rawls, *Justice as Fairness: A Restatement*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard

---

<sup>1</sup> Locke and Mill readings are available via HSU Library databases. Go to 1) Library Homepage 2) Select 'Databases' on left of screen 3) Select 'P' at top of screen 4) Select "Past Masters" 5) Select "British Philosophy: 1600-1900" 6) Select Locke and Mill readings

University Press, 2001.  
Adam Smith, *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the  
Wealth of Nations*, Bk. 4, ch. 2

### III. **Environmental Approaches (largely) within a Liberal Framework**

**September 9<sup>th</sup>**: Administrative Rationalism

Required Readings:

**DTE**, Section III (\*Bartlett; Lee; Torgerson)

\*Dryzek, Chapter 4 (**ONCORES**)

*On Cost-Benefit Analysis:*

\*Leonard and Zeckhauser, "Cost-Benefit Analysis Applied to Risks" (**ONCORES**)

\*Kelman, "Cost-Benefit Analysis: An Ethical Critique" (**ONCORES**)

DEBATE: LEONARD AND ZECKHAUSER *VS.* KELMAN

Additional Readings:

Deborah Stone, *Policy Paradox: The Art of Political Decision Making*, W.W.  
Norton: 1997, esp. Ch. 10

John Gillroy, ed. *Environmental Risk, Environmental Values, and Political Choices:  
Beyond Efficiency Trade-Offs in Public Policy Analysis*. Westview Press,  
1993.

Gillroy and Wade, eds. *Moral Dimensions of Public Policy Choice*, University of  
Pittsburgh Press, 1992.

Paehlke and Torgerson, eds. *Managing Leviathan: environmental politics and the  
administrative state* Broadview Press, 1990.

Donald A. Brown, "Ethics, Science, and Environmental Regulation" in Susan J.  
Armstrong and Richard G. Botzler, *Environmental Ethics: Divergence and  
Convergence*. McGraw Hill, 1993.

**September 16<sup>th</sup>**: Sustainable Development and Globalization

Required Readings:

**DTE**, Chapters 17 (WCED)

\*Sharachchandra M. Lele, "Sustainable Development: A Critical Review" in Conca and  
Dabelko, eds. *Green Planet Blues* Westview, 1998. (**ONCORES**)

\*Hawken, Lovins, and Lovins, *Natural Capitalism: Creating the Next Industrial  
Revolution*. Boston: Little, Brown, 1999. (**Ch. 1 - ONCORES**) (**Ch. 15 – in  
FH 143**)

\*Paehlke; \*Dryzek; \*Lipshutz, "Globalization and Resistance: Current Debates" in  
*Global Environmental Politics* 1 (1): 1-22. (**ONCORES**)

DEBATE: PAEHLKE *VS.* DRYZEK *VS.* LIPSHUTZ

Additional Readings:

**DTE**, Chapters 18, 19, 21, 23 (Lafferty, Daly, Weale, Beck)

Hajer, *The Politics of Environmental Discourse*.

**Dryzek**, Chapters. 7,8

Luke, *Ecocritique: Contesting The Politics of Nature, Economy, and Culture*.  
University of Minnesota Press, 1997, esp. ch.5.

**September 23<sup>rd</sup>**: Animal Rights and the Environment

Required Readings:

\*Regan, from *The Case for Animal Rights* (**ONCORES**)

\*Callicott, "Animal Liberation and the Land Ethic: A Triangular Affair"  
(**ONCORES**)

\*Singer, *Practical Ethics*, chapter 3 and "Environmental Values" (**ONCORES**)

DEBATE: REGAN/SINGER *VS.* CALLICOTT

Additional Readings:

Josephine Donovan, "Animal Rights and Feminist Theory"

Mary Anne Warren "The Rights of the Nonhuman World," in *the Animal  
Rights/Environmental Ethics Debate*, ed. Hargrove. SUNY: 1992

Roderick Nash "Ethical Extension and Radical Environmentalism" in *The  
Rights of Nature*

Stone, *Earth and Other Ethics*,. New York: Harper and Row, 1987.(esp. chs9 & 17)

Holmes Rolson, *Environmental Ethics*, chs. 1-6. Philadelphia: Temple, 1988.

Bernard E. Rollin, *Animal rights and Human Morality* ch. 1. New York: Prometheus,  
1981.

**September 30<sup>th</sup>**: Classical Liberalism and the Environment

Required Readings:

\*Anderson and Leal, **FME**, Ch. 1,2, 13 and browse rest of book for specific examples

\*Herman E. Daly, "Free-Market Environmentalism: Turning a Good Servant into a  
Bad Master," *Critical Review* 6 (2-3) Spring-Summer 1992: 171-184.

(**ONCORES**)

DEBATE: DALY *VS.* ANDERSON & LEAL

Additional Readings:

**DTE** Chapters 15, 16 (Mitchell and Simmons, Goodin)

**Dryzek**, Chapter 6

Mark Sagoff, "Free Market Versus Libertarian Environmentalism," *Critical Review*  
6 (2-3) Spring-Summer 1992: 211-230.

Tom Bethell, "Property and the Environment," in *The Noblest Triumph* (St. Martins,  
1998).

Mark Sagoff, "Property and the Value of Land" in *The Economy of the Earth*,  
Cambridge University Press, 1988.

On Takings:

5<sup>th</sup> Amendment of the U.S. Constitution

Marzulla, "Property Rights Movement: How It Began and Where It is Headed"

Emerson, "Taking the Land Rights Movement Seriously"

**October 7<sup>th</sup>: Green Democracy: Within or Beyond Liberalism?  
Deadline for Consultation on Paper (A) proposal**

Required Readings:

**DTE** Chapters 10, 39: (\*Sagoff; \*Plumwood)

\*Michael Maniates, “Individualization: Plant a Tree, Buy a Bike, Save the World?”  
In *Confronting Consumption*. MIT Press 2002.

[webpub.alleggheny.edu/employee/m/mmaniate/es/individualization.doc](http://webpub.alleggheny.edu/employee/m/mmaniate/es/individualization.doc)

\*Gillroy and Bowersox, eds., “Democratic Competence, Accountability, and  
Education in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century.” In *The Moral Austerity of Environmental  
Decisionmaking*. Duke University Press 2002 (PP. 314-339). **(ONCORES)**

\*Tim Hayward, “Environmental Rights as Democratic Rights” **(ONCORES)**

Additional Readings:

**de-Shalit**, Chapter 5

**DTE**, Chapters 11, 12, 13 (Paehlke, Wiesenthal, Ophuls and Boyan)

**Dryzek**, Chapters 5 & 11

Ben A. Minteer and Bob Pepperman Taylor, eds. *Democracy and the Claims of  
Nature*. Rowman and Littlefield, 2002.

William Shutkin, *The Land that Could Be*. MIT Press, 2000.

Robert Paehlke, *Democracy’s Dilemma*. MIT Press, 2003.

Gunderson, *The Environmental Promise of Democratic Deliberation*, University of  
Wisconsin Press, 1995.

**October 14<sup>th</sup>: Paper (A) Proposal DUE; or Paper (B) DUE; Presentations**

**October 21<sup>st</sup>: Presentations continued**

**IV. Environmental Challenges to Liberalism**

**October 28<sup>th</sup>: Ecocentrism and Deep Ecology**

Required Readings:

**DTE**, Chapters 24, 25, 27 (Naess, Foreman, \*Eckersley)

\*Devall, “The Deep, Long-Range Ecology Movement: 1960-2000—A Review”  
**(ONCORES)**

Callicott, “Conceptual Foundations of the Land Ethic” **(ONCORES)**

\*Tim Luke, “Deep Ecology as Political Philosophy” from *Ecocritique* **(ONCORES)**

\*Guha, “Radical American Environmentalism and Wilderness Preservation”  
**(ONCORES)**

DEBATE: DEVALL/ECKERSLEY VS. LUKE/GUHA

Additional Readings:

**Dryzek**, Ch. 9

George Sessions, *Deep Ecology for the Twenty-First Century*.

Gary Varner, “A Critique of Environmental Holism,” In *Nature’s  
Interests*

Christopher Stone, *The Gnat is Older than Man: Global Environmentalism and*

- Human Agenda*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993.
- David Rothenberg, "Have a Friend for Lunch: Norwegian Radical Ecology Versus Tradition," in *Ecological Resistance Movements*, ed. Bron R. Taylor. Albany: SUNY, 1995.
- Jerry A. Stark, "Postmodern Environmentalism: A Critique of Deep Ecology," in *Ecological Resistance Movements* (see above).

**November 4<sup>th</sup>**: Ecofeminism and Eco-socialism

Required Readings:

- \*Karen Warren, *Ecofeminist Philosophy*, chs. 1 and 3 (**CH. 1 – ONCORES; CH. 3 – FH 143**)
- DTE**, Chapters 20, 30 (\*King, \*Shiva)
- \*Joel Kovel, from *Enemy of Nature*, chs. 3 & 4 (**Ch.3–ONCORES; Ch. 4–FH 143**)
- de-Shalit, Chapter 6**

Additional Readings

- Dryzek**, Chapter 10
- David Pepper, "Anthropocentrism, humanism, and eco-socialism" in *Environmental Politics* 2 (3) 1993: 428-52.
- Capitalism, Nature, Socialism* (Journal)
- Murray Bookchin, *Remaking Society: Pathways to a Green Future*. South End Press, 1990. (also **DTE** Chapter 29)
- Val Plumwood, *Feminism and the Mastery of Nature*. Routledge, 1993.

**November 11<sup>th</sup>**: Environmental Justice: 1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> World Views

Required Readings:

- DTE**, Chapters 33, 34, 35, (FNPCELS, Bullard, \* Krauss)
- \* Larry Lohmann, "Visitors to the Commons," in Bron Raymond Taylor, ed. *Ecological Resistance Movements* (SUNY, 1995). (**ONCORES**)
- \* Ramachandra Guha, "The Environmentalism of the Poor," in *Varieties of Environmentalism* (Earthscan, 1997). (**ONCORES**)
- \* David Schlosberg, "The Justice of Environmental Justice" (**ONCORES**)

Additional Readings:

- David Schlosberg, *Environmental Justice and the New Pluralism* Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Robert Bullard, ed. *Confronting Environmental Racism: Voices from the Grassroots* South End Press, 1993.
- Daniel Faber, ed. *The Struggle for Ecological Democracy* Guilford, 1998.
- Troy W. Hartley, "Environmental Justice: An Environmental Civil Rights Value Acceptable to All World Views," *Environmental Ethics* 17.3 (1995): 277-289.

**November 18<sup>th</sup>**: Communitarianism

Required Readings:

- \*E.F. Schumacher, "Buddhist Economics" in *Small is Beautiful* (Perennial, 1973).  
[www.schumachersociety.org/buddhisteconomics.html](http://www.schumachersociety.org/buddhisteconomics.html)

\*Herman Daly and John Cobb, *For the Common Good* (Beacon, 1989). (ONCORES)

\*Michael Kenny, "Paradoxes of Community" in *Democracy and Green Political Thought* (Routledge, 1996), 19-35. (ONCORES)

DTE Chapter 26 (\*Dodge)

de-Shalit Chapter 4

DEBATE: KENNY VS. SCHUMACHER, DALY AND COBB

Additional Readings:

Wendell Berry, *The Unsettling of America* (Sierra Club Books, 1977).

William Ophuls, *Requiem for Modern Politics* (Westview, 1997).

V. **Defining, Owning, and Engineering "Nature"**

**December 2<sup>nd</sup>:** Postmodernism, Social Construction, and their critics

Required Readings:

\* W. Cronon, "The Trouble with Wilderness, or, Getting Back to the Wrong Nature," from *Uncommon Ground* (ONCORES)

\*Gary Lease, "Nature under Fire," (ONCORES)

Bill Chaloupka, "Jagged Terrain" (ONCORES)

\*Kate Soper, "The Discourses of Nature," (ONCORES)

\*John Meyer, "Rights to Life? On Nature, Property and Biotechnology," *Journal of Political Philosophy* 8.2 (2000): 154-175. (ONCORES)

DEBATE: CRONON VS. LEASE

Additional Readings:

Michael Soule, "The Social Siege of Nature," in *Reinventing Nature*.

Soper, "Ecology, Nature, and Responsibility" from *What is Nature?*

Keekok Lee, *The Natural and the Artefactual: The Implications of Deep Science and Deep Technology for Environmental Philosophy*. Lanham: Lexington Books, 1999.

Max Oelschlaeger, "Cosmos and Wilderness: A Postmodern Philosophy," in *The Idea of Wilderness: From Prehistory to the Age of Ecology*. New Haven: Yale, 1991.

*Uncommon Ground: Toward Reinventing Nature*, ed. William Cronon. New York: W.W. Norton, 1995.

"The Great Wild Hope", William Chaloupka and R. McGregor Cawley, *In the Nature of Things*

**December 9<sup>th</sup>:** Course Conclusion

Required Readings:

\*de-Shalit, Chapter 3.

**MONDAY DECEMBER 15<sup>th</sup>: Paper (A or C) Due**